Comparative study on WHO Western Pacific Region and World Federation of Chinese Medicine Societies international standard terminologies on traditional medicine: Syndrome Differentiation According to Eight Principles (Part two)

Zhao-guo LI
1. College of Foreign Languages, Shanghai Normal University, Shanghai 200234, China
2. Secretariat of Specialty Committee of Translation, World Federation of Chinese Medicine Societies, Shanghai 200234, China

Keywords: linguistics; terminology; translation; English; terms, traditional Chinese medicine; diagnosis; eight principles

WHO 西太区与世界中医药学会联合会中医名词术语
国际标准比较研究：八纲辨证（二）

李照国
1. 上海师范大学外国语学院，上海 200234
2. 世界中医药学会联合会翻译专业委员会秘书处，上海 200234

关键词：语言学；科学技术；翻译；英语；中医名词；诊断；八纲

The Chinese characters 表 and 肆 reflect two Chinese concepts. In traditional Chinese medicine (TCM), these two concepts are used as two principles in analyzing the location, tendency and severity of diseases. The Chinese character 表 literally means “external” or “exterior” or “surface” while the character 肆 literally means “internal” or “interior” or “inside”. As two concepts in TCM, 表 and 肆 are quite rich in connotation and may be related to different referents under different conditions. In terms of translation, 表 and 肆 are quite easy to render, either rendering them as “external and internal” or “exterior and interior”.

However, in translation of 表 and 肆 in the related terms, cares have to be taken to clarify the underlined logical relationship according to their structure. In this article, the author is trying to analyze the English translation and international standardization of the related terms according to WHO International Standard Terminologies on Traditional Medicine in the Western Pacific Region[1] (abbreviated as WPRO Standard) and International Standard Chinese-English Basic Nomenclature of Chinese Medicine compiled by World Federation of Chinese Medicine Societies[2] (abbreviated as WFCMS Standard) on the basis of the studies made in the book entitled International Standardization of English Translation of Traditional Chinese Medicine: Study of Theory, Sum-
marization of Practice and Exploration of Methods[3].

表里辨证 exterior-interior pattern identification/syndrome differentiation: categorization of patterns/syndromes according to the location of the disease, in the exterior or in the interior, superficially seated or deeply seated.

To translate the Chinese term 表里辨证 as “exterior-interior pattern identification” or “exterior-interior syndrome differentiation” is quite similar to the current translation practice. However, usually in translation of this term, “and” is used to connect “exterior” and “interior” instead of using a hyphen.

表证 exterior pattern/syndrome: a general term for patterns/syndromes that occur chiefly at the early stage of external contractions affecting the exterior part of the body, characterized by a sudden onset, aversion to cold or to wind, fever, headache, generalized pain, thin white tongue coating, and floating pulse.

In this definition, the expression “external contraction” seems to be the translation of the Chinese term 外感. In the current translation practice, the English word “exogenous” is often used to translate 外感 as in the terms like 外感头痛 which is usually translated as “exogenous headache” and 外感腰痛 which is frequently rendered as “exogenous lumbago”.

里证 interior pattern/syndrome: a general term for patterns/syndromes that indicate the existence of disease in the interior of the body such as bowels and viscera, qi and blood, or bone marrow.

In this definition, “bowels” seems to be used to refer to 腹 in TCM. Such a translation is in fact quite inaccurate because the Chinese concept 腹 includes bowels, but not just bowels. In fact, 腹 covers a number of the internal organs, including gallbladder, stomach, large intestine, small intestine, bladder and sanjiao (三焦) which is rendered as “triple energizer” in WPRO Standard on acupuncture and moxibustion nomenclature.

半表半里证 half-exterior half-interior pattern/syndrome: a variety of patterns/syndromes due to affliction located between the exterior and interior of the body, marked by alternate fever and chills, fullness and choking feeling in the chest and costal region, bitter taste in the mouth, dry throat, nausea and loss of appetite, and string-like pulse.

The Chinese character 半 in 半表半里 is also frequently translated with the English morpheme “semi”. So in some Chinese-English dictionaries of TCM, 半表半里 is translated as “semi-exterior and semi-interior syndrome”. The expression “choking feeling in the chest” seems to be the translation of the Chinese term 胸闷 which is often rendered as “chest oppression”. The expression “string-like pulse” is obviously the translation of the Chinese term 弦脉 which is also frequently translated as “taut pulse” or “wiry pulse”.

表寒证；风寒束表证 exterior cold pattern/syndrome: a pattern/syndrome arising when wind-cold invades the exterior and characterized by pronounced aversion to cold with mild fever, headache, generalized pain, absence of sweating, thin white tongue coating, and tight floating pulse, the same as the pattern/syndrome of wind-cold fettering the exterior.

The Chinese terms 表寒证 and 风寒束表证 appear similar to each other in meaning. However they are two separate terms in TCM with evident difference in connotation. It is better to take them as two different terms and translate them differently. In the current translation practice, 表寒证 is usually translated as “exterior cold pattern/syndrome” and 风寒束表证 is often rendered as “wind-cold fettering the exterior” as seen in the definition of this term in WFCMS Standard. However in WFCMS Standard, there is no definite article before “exterior”. Grammatically speaking, definite article “the” cannot be omitted in this case.

表热证；风热犯表证；风热袭表证 exterior heat pattern/syndrome: a pattern/syndrome arising when wind-heat invades the exterior and characterized by marked fever with mild aversion to wind and cold, headache, sore throat, sweating and thirst, thin yellow tongue coating and rapid floating pulse, the same as the pattern/syndrome of wind-heat invading the exterior.

The Chinese terms 风热犯表证 and 风热袭表证 are quite similar to each other in meaning and may be reasonably taken as one term in translation. However, 表热证 is a quite different term in both structure and connotation. Semantically speaking, “exterior heat pattern/syndrome” can be understood as 表热证, but not as 风热犯表证 and 风热袭表证. In WFCMS Standard, 风热犯表证 is translated as "syndrome/pattern of wind-heat invading exterior".

表虚证 exterior deficiency pattern/syndrome: a type of exterior pattern/syndrome resulting from attack by wind while the body’s resistance is
lowered, manifested by intolerance of wind, persistent sweating, fever, headache, thin white tongue coating, and floating relaxed pulse.

In this definition, the expression “intolerance of wind” is the translation of the Chinese term 恶风 which is also translated as “aversion to wind” in WPRO Standard. Both ways of translation are used quite frequently in the current translation practice. The expression “floating relaxed pulse” seems to be the translation of the Chinese term 脉浮缓 which actually means floating and moderate pulse. The Chinese character 缓 in 脉浮缓 is often misunderstood as “slow” or “relaxed”. In TCM, slow pulse is called 迟脉 which means that the pulse beats less than fifty times in a minute while moderate pulse is known as 缓脉 which means that the pulse beats less than sixty times in a minute.

表实证 exterior excess pattern/syndrome: an exterior pattern/syndrome with fever, aversion to cold, headache and generalized aching, forceful or tight floating pulse and absence of sweating, showing the external part of the body being attacked by cold, yet the patient’s defense qi is not damaged.

In this definition, the expression “tight floating pulse” seems to be the translation of the Chinese term 脉紧 which is normally translated as “floating and tight pulse”, structurally the same as the original Chinese term in which 紧 modifies 禾. The Chinese term 卫气 is translated as “defense qi”, quite similar to the common practice in TCM translation. However, in the current translation field, 卫气 is often rendered as “defensive qi”.

风湿袭表证 pattern/syndrome of wind-dampness assailing the exterior: a pattern/syndrome resulting from wind-dampness invading the exterior part of the body, manifested by heavy cumbersome limbs, dizziness with heavy head, aversion to cold, fever not relieved after sweating, oppression in the chest, no desire to drink, white slimy tongue coating and soggy relaxed pulse.

In this definition, the expression “heavy cumbersome limbs” seems to be the translation of the Chinese term 四肢困重 which is usually translated as “heaviness of limbs”. Comparatively speaking, “heavy cumbersome limbs” is better than “heaviness of limbs” in meaning. The expression “soggy relaxed pulse” seems to be the translation of the Chinese term 脉濡缓. As analyzed in the above about the translation of 脉濡缓, the Chinese character 缓 means moderate, not relaxed.

暑湿袭表证 pattern/syndrome of summer heat dampness assailing the exterior: a pattern/syndrome resulting from summer heat dampness attacking the exterior part of the body, manifested by fever, slight aversion to wind and cold, fatigued and cumbersome body, heavy head as if swathed or grimy face, thirst and vexation, reddenened tongue with yellow slimy coating and rapid soggy pulse.

The Chinese term 暑湿袭表 is often translated as “summer dampness attacking the exterior” as is seen in the definition of this term in WPRO Standard. In the Chinese term 暑湿袭表, the word 暑湿 can be simply rendered as “summer dampness” instead of “summer heat dampness” and the character 表 is often translated as “attack” or “invade”. The English word “assail” is seldom used in the translation of 表 as is done in WFCMS Standard in which the term 暑湿袭表 is translated as “syndrome/pattern of summer heat-dampness attacking exterior” while 风湿袭表 is rendered as “syndrome/pattern of wind-dampness attacking exterior”.

卫表不固证 defense-exterior insecurity pattern/syndrome: a pattern/syndrome marked by fear of cold, spontaneous sweating, shortness of breath, lack of strength, pale tongue and weak pulse.

To translate 卫表不固证 as “defense-exterior insecurity pattern/syndrome” seems unclear in meaning. In this term, the Chinese concept 卫表 just means surface of the body. Since defensive qi is normally flowing in the surface of the body. That is why the surface of the body is called 卫表. The Chinese concept 不固 in this term just means weakness. Thus in many Chinese-English dictionaries of TCM, 卫表不固 is translated as “weakness of body surface”. However, in both WPRO and WFCMS Standards, 不固 is translated as “insecurity”.

里寒证 interior cold pattern/syndrome: a type of interior pattern/syndrome attributable to deficiency of yang qi of bowels and viscera or external cold directly attacking on or passing to the interior, mainly manifested by intolerance of cold with cold limbs, somber white complexion, absence of thirst or liking for hot drinks, long-term voiding of clear urine, pale tongue with white moistened coating and slow sunken pulse.

In this definition, the expression “somber white complexion” seems to be the translation of the
Chinese term 面色苍白. However, this Chinese term simply means pale or pallor. In the expression “liking for hot drinks”, the English word “liking” is used to translate the Chinese character 喜. However in defining 亡阳证 and other related terms in WPRO Standard, the Chinese character 喜 is also translated as “craving”. In the current translation practice, 喜 is also translated as “preference”.

里热证 interior heat pattern/syndrome: a type of interior pattern/syndrome with exuberant heat arising when external pathogens enter the internal organs and transform into heat, mainly manifested by fever with sweating, thirst with intake of fluid, vexation, bitter taste in the mouth, short voiding of reddish urine, a reddened tongue with yellow coating, and rapid surging or rapid string-like pulse.

In this definition, the expression “thirst with intake of fluid” is understandable, but seems still in need of careful consideration, especially the word “fluid” which appears confusing in this expression. The word “surging” seems to be used to translate the Chinese character 滚 which is often translated as “full”. However, comparatively speaking, “surging” seems better than “full” in revealing the meaning of this Chinese character.

里虚证 interior deficiency pattern/syndrome: a type of interior pattern/syndrome attributable to deficiency of qi, blood, yin, and yang of the internal organs with diminished function, usually manifested by shortage of qi, reluctance to speak, listlessness, lassitude, palpitations, dizziness, tinnitus, decreased food intake, aching limbs and limp knees, pale tender-soft tongue and weak pulse.

In this definition, the expression “shortage of qi” seems to be the translation of the Chinese term 少气 which literally means shortage of qi but actually means shortness of breath. The expression “reluctance to speak” is obviously the translation of the Chinese term 喘气 which is often translated as “no desire to speak” as found in WPRO Standard.

里实证 interior excess pattern/syndrome: 1) any pattern/syndrome resulting from external pathogen transforming into heat and entering the interior to bind in the stomach and intestines, manifested by high fever, vexing thirst, abdominal pain and constipation; 2) a general term for patterns/syndromes caused by retention of phlegm, blood stasis, food stagnation or accumulation of parasitic worms.

In this definition, the expression “external pathogen transforming into heat and entering the interior to bind in the stomach and intestines” is the translation of the Chinese phrase 外邪化热入里结于肠胃, quite clear and understandable. However, the Chinese character 热 is now usually translated as “pathogenic factor”, avoiding use of the word “pathogen” because it sounds too modern and always implies something like bacteria and virus. But in Chinese, 热 refers to any factors, including environmental, mental and physical ones, that may cause or induce diseases and disorders. The expression “food stagnation” seems to be the translation of the Chinese term 食滞 which actually means retention of food.

表里俱寒证 pattern/syndrome of dual exterior and interior cold: a pattern/syndrome arising when cold pathogen attacks the exterior and interior of the body simultaneously, usually manifested by aversion to cold with cold limbs, headache and generalized pain, cold pain in the abdomen, vomiting and diarrhea, cough and dyspnea with whitish expectoration, pale tongue with white coating and tight pulse, also called the exterior-interior cold pattern/syndrome.

The Chinese character 俱 in the term 表里俱寒 is also frequently translated as “simultaneous” or “both” which are adopted in WPRO Standard when defining related terms. So in the current translation practice the Chinese term 表里俱寒 is often translated as “cold in both the interior and exterior” or “simultaneous cold in the interior and exterior”.

表里俱热证 pattern/syndrome of dual exterior and interior heat: a heat pattern/syndrome involving both the exterior and the interior, caused either by heat pathogen entering the interior before the exterior pattern/syndrome is resolved or by superimposition of an exterior pattern/syndrome of newly contracted warm disease on a preexisting interior pattern/syndrome, usually manifested by fever, aversion to wind, headache, flushed face, thirst, vexation or even delirium, constipation, dark-colored urine, reddened tongue with dry yellow coating and rapid forceful floating pulse, also called the exterior-interior heat pattern/syndrome.

In this definition, 表里俱热证 is described as “heat pattern/syndrome involving both the exterior and the interior”. Such a description is
actually a frequent way currently adopted in the translation of this term. The expression “rapid forceful floating pulse” lacks punctuation and thus appears awkward in pronunciation.

Similarly, the expression “excess pattern/syndrome involving both the exterior and interior” is also a way frequently adopted in translating 表里俱实 in current translation practice.

In this definition, the expression “shortage of qi and reluctance to speak” is evidently the translation of the Chinese term 少气懒言. Just as analyzed above about the term 里虚证, the Chinese phrase 少气 means shortness of breath, not shortage of qi. However, to translate the Chinese phrase 懒言 as “reluctance to speak” is undoubtedly clear, concise and accurate, sounding better than “no desire to speak”, another commonly used way to translate 懒言.

In this definition, “cold pathogen fetters the exterior” seems to be the translation of the Chinese term 寒邪束表. To translate the Chinese character 束 in this Chinese term as “fetter” sounds quite accurate and vivid. The expression “depressed heat” seems to be the translation of the Chinese term 热郁 which in fact means stagnation of heat or accumulation of heat. To use the English word “depressed” to translate the Chinese character 郁 seems still in need of careful consideration. The phrase “pseudo-cold” is certainly the translation of the Chinese term 假寒. However, in WPRO Standard, the Chinese character 假 in 假寒假热 or 假热假寒 is also translated as “false”.

In this definition and some other places in WPRO Standard, the English word “pale” is used to translate the Chinese character 淡 in term 舌淡. Such a translation does not sound quite accurate because the Chinese character 淡 in this term just means light-colored.

In this definition, the English word “defense” seems to be used to refer to the Chinese concept 卫表 or just 表. However, such a way of translation seems unclear and inadequate. Perhaps the better translation of 卫表 or 表 is body surface.

In this definition, “fever with absence of sweating” is certainly the translation of the Chinese term 发热无汗. However, in WPRO Standard, this Chinese term is also translated as “fever without sweat” which sounds much better than “fever with absence of sweating”. The expression “listlessness and lassitude” seems to be the translation of the Chinese term 神疲 which literally means mental fatigue or spiritual exhaustion. To translate 神疲 as “listlessness and lassitude” seems still in need of consideration. If the
English word “listlessness” is used to translate the Chinese character 病, then 神疲 may be properly translated as “mental listlessness”. The English word “lassitude” is usually used to describe weakness of the limbs that cannot be raised or moved.

内闭外脱证 pattern/syndrome of internal block and external collapse: a pattern/syndrome in which excess pathogens are trapped in the interior (as manifested by fever, cough and dyspnea, or by abdominal pain with tenesmus, or by constipation and urinary block, or by colicky pain in the chest, epigastrum and abdomen) while the healthy qi collapses (as manifested by pallor, reversal cold of limbs, cold dripping sweats, feeble breathing and scarcely perceptible pulse).

The Chinese phrase 内闭外脱 is also translated as “internal closure” or “internal obstruction”. In this definition, “reversal cold of limbs” seems to be the translation of the Chinese term 四肢厥冷 which is often simply translated as “coldness of limbs” or “cold limbs”. Comparatively speaking, “reversal cold of limbs”, though sounding awkward, seems better than “coldness of limbs” or “cold limbs” because it at least has revealed part of the meaning of 厥. In TCM, 厥, as a sort of syndrome, often means three things, one is sudden syncope or coma, one is coldness of limbs, and one is inhibited urination or polyuria. As a character in Chinese, 厥 sometimes means disorder or reverse movement as in the terms like 厥气 which means disorder of qi and 厥血 which is a disorder caused by reverse movement of liver qi and characterized by qi rushing reversely upwards, stomachache, coldness of feet, vomiting, difficulty to take food and lower abdominal pain involving the testis.

REFERENCES

1. World Health Organization Western Pacific Region. WHO international standard terminologies on traditional medicine in the Western Pacific Region. 2007.


2010 年美国针灸学会年会纪要

曹庆娟，费宇彤，刘建平

北京中医药大学循证医学中心，北京 100029

2010 年美国针灸学会年会（Society for Acupuncture Research 2010 International Conference）于 2010 年 3 月 18～21 日在美国北卡罗来纳州教堂山举办。这次大会由美国针灸学会（Society for Acupuncture Research, SAR）主办，大会的主题为：“针灸的转化研究：科学、实践与服务大众的桥梁”（Translational research in acupuncture; bridging science, practice & community）。会议旨在建立针灸领域的实验研究、临床研究和临床实践之间的动态桥梁，加速针刺基础和临床研究成果在临床实践中的应用以使病人受益。会议关注针刺领域的转化研究和循证医学研究证据在临床实践应用中面临的问题和对策。

美国针灸学会最初是由 Patricia Culliton, Hannah Bradford 和 Stephen Birch 在 1991 年共同创立的一个名为“针灸研究委员会”的非正式组织。该组织最早的会议议题是探讨关于针灸研究的方法学问题。在 1991～1992 年进行了多次会议以后，该组织发展成为一个正式的机构，即针灸学会(SAR)。SAR 创建之始是为了在针灸及东方医学研究领域开拓科学的思路和募集基金。发展至今，SAR 已经制定了以针灸及东方医学研究方法学为专题的研讨会年会计划。